Rockford Historic Preservation Commission

October 6, 2009 – 6:00 PM Conference Room B Rockford City Hall

Present Janna Bailey, David Hagney, Scott Sanders, Maureen Flanagan, Mark McInnis

Absent Ald. Doug Mark

Staff Ginny Gregory

Others Ron & Julie Sunday, George Gayle, Martha Lilja, Scott Feirn, Rick Strader

Election of Chairman

David Hagney made a **MOTION** to **ELECT** Maureen Flanagan as Chairman. The motion was seconded by Scott Sanders and **CARRIED** by a vote of 5-0.

Election of Vice-Chairman

Maureen Flanagan made a **MOTION** to **ELECT** David Hagney as Vice-Chairman. The motion was seconded by Scott Sanders and **CARRIED** by a vote of 5-0.

NEW BUSINESS

Certificate of Appropriateness – 922 North Prospect Street

Ron Sunday explained he wanted to demolish the rear enclosure of the property, which was not part of the original house, to make the home a single-family once again. He proposed eliminating the stairwell to the upper floor.

Scott asked if the door on the second floor was added or if it was originally a window. Ron wasn't sure what was there originally, but indicated he wanted to put a window in its place that would match the window above it.

David Hagney made a **MOTION** to **APPROVE** the Certificate of Appropriateness. The motion was seconded by Doug Mark and **CARRIED** by a vote of **5-0**.

Certificate of Appropriateness – 526 Indian Terrace

George Gayle explained he wanted to install a balustrade on the porch which requires replacing the railings. He indicated there was a house on Hyatt Avenue that had a similar balustrade.

Maureen asked if George planned to replace the porch as well. George did not have any plans on replacing the porch as he already replaced the north end of the porch a couple of years ago.

Rockford Historic Preservation Commission Minutes for October 6, 2009 Meeting Page 2

Scott asked what color George planned on painting the railing. George indicated he planned on painting the railings an ivory color.

Mark McInnis asked if the pipe rail would be removed. George replied the pipe, which was temporary, would be removed.

David asked which size of newell post would be used. Referring to photos he had submitted with his application, George believed it might be the 3'x 36" post, whichever one was thinner.

Maureen asked if new corner posts would be added. George explained the railing would run between two supports on the top and bottom of the stairs, so corner posts would not be needed.

Mark McInnis made a **MOTION** to **APPROVE** the Certificate of Appropriateness. The motion was seconded by Janna Bailey and **CARRIED** by a vote of **5-0**.

Certificate of Appropriateness – 828 Garfield Avenue

David asked if the dormers were covered with asphalt shingles Martha Lilja answered they were. Martha stated she visited other historical neighborhoods to discover what other homes were using around dormers and found only one other with asphalt shingles.

David explained vinyl siding wasn't acceptable material to use on historic homes. Martha understood that and was willing to use a wood material; however the roof is extremely steep without much area to stand on and paint every few years. She mentioned the soffits are aluminum. She pointed out the photograph of the wood-grain look of the vinyl she proposed to use.

David asked if Martha had looked into cement board siding, which, theoretically, holds paint for up to 15 years. Martha hadn't heard of that material before.

Maureen asked about the size of the area that needs to be covered. Martha indicated it was very small and not much of the area would be visible.

Martha stated she was willing to look into other materials but did not want to shingle the area. David suggested she look into smooth cement board or cedar siding or shingles that could be stained solid. He believed cedar shingles would be most appropriate. Martha indicated the house does not have any cedar on it now and the only other house they found with cedar shingles looked odd to her. David suggested keeping the corner boards or not applying corner boards, just using a smooth corner.

David Hagney made a **MOTION** to **APPROVE** the Certificate of Appropriateness, using either cedar siding with the same exposure as the shingles already on the house, cedar shingles with the same exposure as the shingles already on the house, or smooth cement board with the same exposure as the shingles already on the house only. The motion was seconded by Scott Sanders and **CARRIED** by a vote of **5-0**.

Certificate of Appropriateness – 401 through 417 Kishwaukee Street

Maureen asked if any of the homes are occupied. Scott Feirn replied 401 Kishwaukee is occupied and is the only one that is currently habitable. The other homes need cosmetic repairs such as carpet and interior paint.

Scott mentioned he wasn't sure what the owners were planning on doing with the properties once the code violations and Historic Preservation Commission violations were corrected.

Scott passed around some photographs and drawings showing the kind of porch railings he was looking at. He believed the country style railings were closer to what would be used. He mentioned Sarah Bell was helping choose colors.

Ginny stated these properties were in Code Hearing last week and the hearing officer ordered the porches to meet City building codes, which would require permits in some cases. At that time, Ginny suggested to Mr. Feirn that he submit an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness so this Commission could approve a railing system. Scott stated whatever railing system was chosen would be used wherever outdoor railings were required on all five properties. He believed all work would be completed by the end of October.

Scott Sanders asked if any cosmetic changes would be made that weren't required for code reasons. Scott Feirn replied not at this time due to budgetary concerns.

Mark believed one of the houses had original railings on it. Ginny answered there were some original railing left on 401 Kishwaukee Street. Scott indicated they planned on preserving any original railing still on the properties. Scott believed he was going to need to re-create one of those railing spindles for that porch. He mentioned the railing on 401 Kishwaukee Street was the only porch of the five properties to have the original railing.

Maureen asked Scott about the violation regarding replacing the metal door with a wooden door. Scott replied they were looking into an appropriate door. There is no overhang for the door which faces north so anything installed there will be exposed to the elements. He considered putting an older style storm door in front to help protect the wooden door. He passed around some photographs of door samples.

Maureen asked if the samples represented interior doors. Scott replied they were currently interior doors in the Kishwaukee homes that could be treated for use as the front door. He mentioned the metal front door was in place when the current owner purchased it. That door needed to be replaced, which is why there is another metal door.

Mark indicated exterior doors, possibly one with less glass, could be purchased at architecture salvage places fairly cheaply. He pointed out any interior door used as an exterior door would require weather stripping and treatment.

David mentioned Frank Hautkamp ran a business on the downtown mall and suggested Scott stop down and see him for exterior doors which may be more appropriate.

Mark McInnis made a **MOTION** to **APPROVE** the Certificate of Appropriateness for the railing spindle. Ginny Gregory will approve the final wooden door with glass based on standards for appropriateness. The motion was seconded by Mark McInnis and **CARRIED** by a vote of **5-0**.

Rockford Historic Preservation Commission Minutes for October 6, 2009 Meeting Page 4

Certificate of Appropriateness – 920 D Street

Rick Strader explained he wanted modifications to his certificate of appropriateness already issued for an addition to his home. Currently the roof is completed, the addition has been framed and the skylights are in. Of the addition, very little was visible from the street.

Maureen asked how many skylights were in the house. Rick replied six skylights per side, so 12 altogether, although they were small.

Rick explained he didn't want to use cedar shake for the siding or true divided lights in the new windows as it would be too costly. He suggested using a cedar shake style made of wood composite board. Maureen stated wood composite doesn't hold up well over time. He next suggested vinyl shaped like cedar shake similar to the type located at 4810 Springbrook Road. Maureen stated this Commission could not approve vinyl but could approve tin. Scott suggested using brick. David suggested using a shaker tile, 4'x8' sheets of cedar shingles with plywood backing. Rick asked him the cost of those but David wasn't sure, although he believed the labor was less than cedar shingles, but the material cost was more. Rick asked how much labor was involved. David suggested staining the material rather than painting.

Rick asked what materials he can't use. He was told he couldn't use vinyl, aluminum or composite. Cement board siding, cedar, brick, wood lap siding, shaker panels, or cedar shingle would be appropriate for the siding.

David suggested not putting any bars in the windows rather than using fake bars on standard double-hung windows. He recommended using divided lights in the one window facing the street and the others can be standards one-over-one lights. Windows with bars on the inside only were not appropriate. Rick asked about a window with a bar between the glass on the outside and inside. David replied that was simulated divided light but true divided light windows would have actual panels of glass in each divider.

David Hagney made a **MOTION** to **APPROVE** the Certificate of Appropriateness, using any of the following materials for the siding: brick, cement board, cedar (shingle, shake), or any kind of wood lap. The front east facing window on the addition is to be wood clad, white, with simulated divided lights. Other windows are not visible from the right-of-way so they are not covered, but side grills are recommended. The motion was seconded by Scott Sanders and **CARRIED** by a vote of **5-0**.

OLD BUSINESS

Certificate of Appropriateness – 904 North Prospect Street

The owner, Jim Pantazelos, submitted this certificate for last month's meeting but did not appear so the application was laid over. Jim has not appeared at this month's meeting. Ginny explained the history of this property for the new Commission members.

Ginny indicated the front door has been replaced with a wooden door and noticed the steps leading up to the porch were under repair. She still needs to verify the railings which are supposed to match the railings on the second floor of the house. She was unsure if the porch would meet building code standards. Ginny indicated there were still no locks on any of the

Rockford Historic Preservation Commission Minutes for October 6, 2009 Meeting Page 5

doors. She noted he was due back in court Thursday, October 8th. She stated she would drive by the house the morning of the hearing to verify if the railings were property installed.

Scott wondered if lathe skirting should be rotated vertical or horizontal rather than diagonal. Ginny indicated it wasn't mentioned on a prior Certificate. Maureen didn't believe this Commission could order him to remove it.

David asked if the property was in violation for the siding. Ginny explained even though the siding was not optimum, it was made of a form of wood and therefore the Commission couldn't cite it.

Scott asked what the outstanding Certificate was requesting. Ginny explained the owner built a new garage in a different location from the now demolished garage, shifting the location of the drive. Jim is requesting to install a new driveway using stamped concrete.

STAFF REPORT

Haunted House at nFactor

Zoning contacted Ginny regarding a haunted house in the athletic pavilion of nFactor. Ginny allowed the haunted house with the stipulation that all vestiges be removed by November 3rd. Maureen asked if it would be visible outside. Ginny stated the haunted house was completely outdoors. Mark mentioned nFactor wanted to do a fall festival with an inflatable bouncing castle for little children and a haunted house for older children. There will also be a flea market. Ginny indicated Zoning still needed to approve the haunted house.

Commission agreed to continue meeting the first Tuesday of the month at 6:00pm at City Hall in conference room B.

The seventh member of the Commission, Vickie Kreuger, was read into City Council on Monday, October 5th.

With no further business, Mark McInnis made a **MOTION** to adjourn. The motion was seconded by David Hagney and **CARRIED** by a vote of **5-0**.